#Justice4marielle: memory, datafication and justice among digital counterpublics that name Marielle Franco

Alejandra J. JOSIOWICZ
State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ)

Bruno DEUSDARÂ
State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ)

Edward SUMMERS
Stanford University

ABSTRACT
This article seeks to examine the digital discursive practice of naming Marielle Franco on Twitter, mobilizing the perspectives and theoretical framework of Digital Humanities in the Global South, Data feminism and Datafication from Below. We also employ the methodology and theoretical framework of Digital Discourse Analysis and Critical Technocultural Discourse Analysis, integrating aspects of Performance Studies and Gender Studies to explore the relevance of memory for contemporary digital counterpublics. We advance a technocultural discourse analysis of tweets that reference Marielle Franco between 2018 and 2023, in Spanish, English and Portuguese. We use a combination of techniques of computational textual analysis implemented in Wolfram Mathematica to study the chronological distribution of tweets; the emergence and relevance of hashtags; the users that were most frequently mentioned and the different topics they mobilized in social networks. Our conclusions point to the digital technocultural discourse on Marielle Franco as practices of memory and mourning that contribute to constitute a digital counterpublic in which...
naming, together with practices of datafication from below, are highly political, and serve not only to reassert collective identity but also to create a vocabulary to speak about the intersectional nature of oppression.

RESUMO
Este artigo busca examinar a prática discursiva digital de nomear Marielle Franco no Twitter, mobilizando as perspectivas e o arcabouço teórico das Humanidades Digitais no Sul Global, o feminismo de dados e a Dataficação desde Baixo. Também empregamos a metodologia e o arcabouço teórico da Análise do Discurso Digital e da Análise Crítica Tecno-Cultural do Discurso, integrando aspectos dos Estudos de Performance e dos Estudos de Gênero para explorar a relevância da memória para os contrapúblicos digitais contemporâneos. Avançamos na direção de uma análise dos tecnodiscursos que referenciam Marielle Franco entre 2018 e 2023, em espanhol, inglês e português. Utilizamos uma combinação de técnicas de análise textual computacional implementadas no Wolfram Mathematica para estudar a distribuição cronológica de tweets, o surgimento e a relevância de hashtags, os usuários mais frequentemente mencionados e os diferentes tópicos que mobilizaram nas redes sociais. Nossas conclusões apontam para as práticas discursivas digitais em torno de Marielle Franco como formas da memória e do luto que contribuem para constituir um contrapúblico digital no qual a nomeação, juntamente com práticas de dataficação desde baixo, são altamente políticas e servem não apenas para reafirmar a identidade coletiva, mas também para criar um vocabulário para falar sobre a natureza interseccional da opressão.

KEYWORDS

PALAVRAS-CHAVE

ABSTRACT FOR A NON-SPECIALIZED AUDIENCE:
This article delves into the intricate dynamics of Twitter conversations concerning Marielle Franco, employing a multi-faceted approach informed by the discipline of Digital Humanities and Digital Discourse Analysis. Through the lens of this framework, we dissect the nuances of online
discourse and its role in shaping collective memory and fostering critical dialogues. Our findings underscore the significance of such digital interactions in cultivating collective identities and talk about the intersectional nature of oppression.

Introduction

Over the past decades, numerous initiatives in Brazil, Latin America, and globally have emerged, aiming to provide access to digital archives that spotlight the contributions of women intellectuals in history and society. These initiatives have triggered discussions on memory as a public space, data privacy concerns, considerations of gender, race, language, and geolocation, and reflections on the dynamics of remembrance and oblivion (Marino et al., 2020; Bergis; Summers; Mitchell, 2018). Various institutions have devised policies and tools to highlight and encourage the creation and dissemination of archives pertaining to historical women intellectuals, revising biographical content and indexing methods, with an emphasis on reclaiming the narratives of women in contemporary public life (Monteiro; Costa, Alves; Mendes, 2019; Josiowicz; Buarque De Hollanda; Alves, 2023).

Nevertheless, we are compelled to inquire: what role does memory play in societies where it has progressively detached from public institutions and integrated into corporate platforms governed by technocratic considerations that influence the constitution of archives (Dias, 2018)? What form of memory politics is viable in natively digital archives constituted from relatively new forms of archiving and processing of big data (Brasil; Nascimento, 2020)? How can digital discursive practices mobilize calls for justice when historical truths are being contested on digital platforms? How do memory practices and resistance persist in digital cultures numbed by the endless promises of consumerism? A fractured discourse of memory arises in the digital environment, where an incessant production of millions of data and metadata takes place, which are collectible and searchable, even though shaped by opaque algorithms (D’andrea, 2020).

This article is part of a broader ongoing research project titled the Digital Observatory of Latin American Women https://mulherdigital.institutodeletras.uerj.br/, which utilizes varied computational tools to construct archives of Latin American Intellectual Women. The project involves the collection, extraction, and analysis of digital discourses that reference and mobilize a select group of women. Its aim is to highlight the often-overlooked contributions of women, LGBTQIA+ individuals, and marginalized communities to digital knowledge production and dissemination. In this article, we delve into the digital discursive practice of referencing and naming Marielle Franco on Twitter, drawing from perspectives from Digital Humanities in the Global South, Data Feminism, and Datafication from Below. These frameworks underscore the significance of datafication from below as a civic practice of participation and resistance, now embedded within the repertoire of social movements.
We also employ the methodology and theoretical framework of Digital Discourse Analysis and Critical Techno-cultural Discourse Analysis, emphasizing the centrality of memory within digital discourses and the critical role of social media activism in challenging dominant narratives and constituting counterpublics (Friedman, 2017; Brock, 2020). Integrating aspects of Performance Studies and Gender Studies, we explore the relevance of memory and performance for Latin American social movements and contemporary digital counterpublics in the Americas, directed at highlighting issues of racial and gender justice among unaware audiences.

The article is structured into three sections. Following a brief introduction, the second part delineates our theoretical approach, incorporating perspectives from Digital Humanities in the Global South, Digital Discourse Analysis, and Datafication from Below. Additionally, it delves into discussions surrounding Memory and Performance among Latin American Digital Counterpublics. The third section encompasses a description of data collection and processing techniques, along with a technodiscursive critical analysis of tweets referencing Marielle Franco. We analyze the historical flow of tweets, prevalent hashtags, frequently mentioned usernames, and significant topics, employing textual analysis tools such as hashtag and user recognition, as well as implementing a topic modelling technique.

1. Digital Humanities in the Global South, Digital Discourse Analysis and Datafication from Below

This article aligns with the Global Turn in Digital Humanities, which emerged in the second decade of the 21st Century (Ricaurte; Chaudhuri; Fiormonte, 2022). Critical approaches within the field have underscored the importance of exploring alternatives to Western Discourses, dominant epistemic canons, and prevailing knowledge paradigms in Digital Humanities (DH), shedding light on the historical marginalization of the Global South, particularly Latin America, within the hegemonic structure of knowledge production and dissemination (Ricaurte; Chaudhuri; Fiormonte, 2022; Del Rio Riande; Fiormonte, 2022). Moreover, they have highlighted the cultural and linguistic underrepresentation of these regions, emphasizing a broader pattern of epistemic oppression (Fernández L’hoeste; Rodriguez, 2020; Ricaurte; Chaudhuri; Fiormonte, 2022). Adopting a decolonial perspective in Digital Humanities, they have emphasized the significance of incorporating Latin American contributions to DH, challenging the perception of Latin America as a mere passive consumer of external theories and methodologies (Fernández L’hoeste; Rodriguez, 2020; Ricaurte; Chaudhuri; Fiormonte, 2022).1 Drawing upon the

---

1 Digital Humanities in Latin America and in the Ibero-American world has experienced a rapid growth in the last few years with several journals, dossiers and books produced in this area; to mention only some examples in recent years: Fernández L’hoeste and Rodríguez (2020); Pimenta and Alves (2021) and Castro (2020). We can also mention Open Access Journals, such as Humanidades Digitales (http://revistas.uned.es/index.php/RHD/index) and the Portuguese-speaking Revista de Humanidades Digitais (https://revistas.uminho.pt/index.php/h2d/issue/view/30).
principles of Intersectional Digital Humanities, Data Feminism, and Digital Feminism, our approach considers data in the context of power inequalities and acknowledges how data collection has historically reinforced power dynamics, perpetuated racial and gender biases, and contributed to the criminalization of poverty in the Americas (D’Ignazio, C.; Klein, 2020; Ricaurte, 2019; 2022). Deploying a decolonial and intersectional perspective on datafication, this article views it as a potential instrument for fostering accountability, reclaiming overlooked histories, and nurturing collective identities and solidarity. We incorporate the concept of datafication from below, which highlights the importance of data as a civic practice of participation and resistance capable of “putting citizens back into the game” which has, during the last few years, entered the repertoire of social movements as part of their strategy of resistance (Risam, 2018; Milan et al., 2019).

Analysis of data colonialism have highlighted the way in which data colonization and algorithmic violence implies the extraction, storage, processing and analysis of data as a way of commodification and dispossession, which materialize the unequal distribution of power in data-centered economies (Ricaurte, 2019; 2022). This is particularly serious in Latin American countries and other contexts affected by data-driven logics, in which governments reproduce data epistemologies as strategies of control and surveillance, reinforcing the domination of marginalized and vulnerable communities (RICAURTE, ZASSO, 2022). However, counting and datafication can also become acts of resistance and epistemic disobedience that have powerful social, political, emotional and cultural dimensions, that are deployed through different strategies and multiple layers (D’Ignazio, C.; Klein, 2020; Ricaurte, 2019; 2022; Milan et al., 2019).

We utilize the methodologies and theoretical frameworks of Digital Discourse Analysis and Technodiscursive Analysis, which employ an integrated techno-semiotic approach, acknowledging technological interfaces and devices as essential components of digital discourses - or techno-discourses-, which should be incorporated when analysing the processes involved in meaning-making (Paveau, 2021; Lourenço Costa, J.; Baronas, 2020). Studies within Digital Discourse Analysis have highlighted the centrality of memory and its specific way of functioning within digital discourses, particularly its association with digital archives and their materiality (Dias, 2016; 2018). These processes are heavily influenced by digital platforms which, as evidenced by scholars in the areas of platform capitalism, platform society, algorithmic capitalism, vigilance capitalism, and data colonialism, are constituted and characterized by technocratic architectures and hierarchies (Ricaurte, 2019; 2022; D’Andrea, 2020; Van Dijck, 2018). Recent examinations in the domain of Critical Techno-cultural Discourse Analysis (CTDA) have illuminated how platforms like the ‘late’ Twitter are not neutral spaces for data collection, extraction, and analysis of social interactions and public content communication (Brock, 2013; 2020). Instead, these platforms exhibit racial, gendered, linguistic, and geopolitical architectures and hierarchies (Brock, 2013; 2020). Nevertheless, research on digital activism reveals that hashtag activism has played a pivotal role in challenging dominant narratives and in exposing instances of police violence, especially against Black individuals in the Americas, facilitating the connection of dispersed, interconnected, and diffuse publics (Brock, 2020).
2. Memory and Performance among Latin American Digital Counterpublics

Since the 1960s and the 1970s, different social movements in Argentina and other Southern Cone countries, particularly movements against Human Rights abuses, have mobilized art and science to seek for justice, memory and reparation. They are part of a long tradition of resistance against authoritarianism through memory in different artistic performances (Taylor, 1994; Nouzeilles, 2005). In Latin American history, different archival devices, whose main objective was to remember, were created and recreated through different kinds of performative and archival aesthetic interventions (Taylor, 1994; Nouzeilles, 2005). For example, scientific developments concerning DNA recognition tools were used to create the Banco Nacional de Datos Genéticos, a public archive and tool that seeks to repair Human Rights Violation by archiving genetic data of persons that disappeared during the Argentinian Military Dictatorship (Lañón Sanchis, 2023). Both Mothers and Grandmothers of Plaza de Mayo and the organizations of HIJOS (Hijos e Hijas por la Identidad y la Justicia contra el Olvido y el Silencio/ Sons and Daughters for Identity and Justice Against Forgetting and Silence), displayed numbers and counts of the disappeared, and of children that had been appropriated illegally (Taylor, 1994). These historical movements highlighted the idea of converting qualitative experience into data as a way to give visibility to causes related to social justice. They showed that counting can be a powerful strategy for resistance, a tool to make power accountable, reclaim overlooked histories and build collectivity and solidarity (D’Ignazio, C.; Klein; 2020, 123). Through community data collection, the gathering and counting of data, these movements were capable of questioning mainstream narratives and stimulating a sense of citizenship and collective identity; they were able to recover agency and strengthen political mobilization against human rights abuses.

More recently, social movements in the cyberspace have used digital technologies, articulated with embodied manifestations, to constitute what researchers have called a digital memory that goes against the totalization and reproducibility of platforms to inscribe themselves in history (Dias, 2018). Datafication as a way of resistance and memory is present in the mobilizations to create national indexes of sexist violence and abuse, which document different kinds of violence against women and LGBTQIA+ persons, in countries such as Argentina (Laudano, 2019), Mexico and Chile, spurring the creation of different types of legislation and official databases and reports². Another example is the project Data for Black Lives, an organization of scientists and activists who use data systems to support social movements’ struggle against oppression and discrimination (https://d4bl.org/about). In Mexico, several projects have deployed official and unofficial databases to visualize demands for Human Rights justice, such as disappeared people (http://personasdesaparecidas.org.mx/ db/db) and the project Feminicides in Mexico (https://feminicidiosmx.crowdmap.com/), which is a map that gives a detailed sense of the nature of gender violence in Mexico.

² See for example: https://www.inegi.org.mx/tablerosestadisticos/vcmm/.

DOI:10.25189/abralin.v212.239
ISSN – online: 0102-7158
V. XXI N. 2, 2002
revista.abralin.org
To analyse digital discursive practices of naming Marielle Franco, it is important to consider mourning as central and constitutive of a sense of political and discursive community and part of a struggle for recognition (Butler, 2004). Mourning strengthens the political nature of collective identity and solidifies social ties (Butler, 2004). This is why the concept of discursive community, as used in discourse analysis, is central, as it implies considering discursive practices as inseparable and produced simultaneously with the groups that generate those discourses (Rocha, 2014). Next to it, the concept of counterpublics is also key, because it highlights how subaltern, historically marginalized publics are capable of reconstituting social identities in their own terms and to speak for themselves, in spaces that enable the contestation of the hegemonic norm (Fraser, 1991; Josiowicz, 2021).

Drawing from performance studies, we highlight digital discursive practices as means of intervention, of the co-construction and co-constitution of historical memory, even if assembled from various localities and temporal references (Fuentes, 2015). We consider the digital practice of naming Marielle Franco as a technodiscursive performance (Brock, 2020) and as a memorializing gesture, which effectively re-generates discursive memory, establishing a genealogy and a lineage (Fuentes, 2015). This kind of technodiscursive performance serves as a method for transmitting and preserving social memory, creating dispersed networks within the realm of digital media (Fuentes, 2015; 2019). This way, the digital practice of naming Marielle Franco resonates with other social movements across the Americas, where digital platforms like the 'late' Twitter have served as the stage for discursive performances of different counterpublics (Bonilla; Rosa, 2015; Fuentes, 2019; Clark, 2015). These movements, scattered across time and space, inside and outside Latin America, and bridging multiple languages, were aimed at bringing attention to issues of racial and gender justice among unaware audiences, utilizing a combination of hashtags and names (Friedman, 2017; Josiowicz, 2021 and 2022). Notable examples include the #NiUnaMenos movement (Laudano, 2019), the #ELENão movement in Brazil (Sivori; Zilli, 2022, p. 28), the #SayHerName movement, and the #BlackLivesMatter movement in the United States (Freelon; Mcilwain; Clark, 2015), as well as #VidasNegrasImportam (Farias, 2022), and the circulation of feminist performances surrounding #Unvioladorentucamino in Chile (Stevani Gisletti; Montero, 2020).

3. Methodology and Analysis: Bringing Marielle to the Present

In our analysis of tweets referencing Marielle Franco, we studied the emergence and relevance of hashtags; the users that are most frequently mentioned and the different topics they mobilised in social networks. Using the Academic Research Track of the Twitter API, released in 2021 (https://developer.twitter.com/en/use-cases/do-research/academic-research), we collected tweets that include the phrase “Marielle Franco” from the entire Twitter archive using Twarc, a Python package for collecting Twitter data, developed by Documenting the Now (https://github.com/DocNow/twarc). We
collected tweets mentioning Marielle Franco in Spanish, English and Portuguese between March 14, 2018, the day of her assassination and March 19, 2023, 5 days after the 5th anniversary of her death. In Spanish, the collection resulted in a total of 301,786. In Portuguese, a total of 2,092,873 tweets. And in English, a total of 181,710 tweets.

At this point, a caveat is warranted. The way we performed our search for mentions of the phrase “Marielle Franco” in Spanish, English and Portuguese meant that Twitter’s API could incorporate content that not necessarily was restricted to tweets including the exact phrase “Marielle Franco”, but that the algorithm deemed relevant to our data. An example is when the hashtag #MariellePresente and #Quemmandoumatarmarielle appears in tweets in which her entire name was not necessarily present, as in a post by Anielle Franco, her sister: “Minha irmã não é palco pra você ficar jogando a sua cortina de fumaça. Assuma sua incompetência e falta de ética. Não se compare a ela! Marielle tinha e tem o que o senhor não tem: caráter e valores! Nos poupe! #QuemMandouMatarMarielle #Marielle #Mariellepresente”. This tweet includes hashtags #QuemMandouMatarMarielle and #MariellePresente but not her complete name. In addition, searching for the phrase “Marielle Franco”, instead of one or more hashtags, has the advantage of permitting comparisons between the uses of the name Marielle Franco in Spanish, Portuguese and English, while searching for specific hashtags would make our data not comparable between languages.

For data processing, we used a combination of qualitative and quantitative research methods implemented in Wolfram Mathematica and Python in Jupiter Notebooks. Wolfram Mathematica is a high-level programming language and a software for textual analysis and processing that allows for a wide range of operations and research methods for different types of texts and in different formats. Despite its linguistic, geopolitical and gendered hierarchies, Mathematica allows for the construction of algorithmic architectures capable of operating with languages such as Spanish, Portuguese and others, while enabling researchers to make critical decisions in terms of the computational processing of the data. Following ethical guidelines and best research practices suggested in previous studies exploring Twitter data, this study safeguarded users’ privacy, did not disclose personal identification, such as usernames or aliases of non-public persons, and avoided citing entire tweets, instead offering links when available (Bergis; Summers; Mitchell, 2018; Trindade, 2020).

---

3 For more information, see: https://devcommunity.x.com/t/keyword-search-on-text-only/170727

4 https://twitter.com/aniellefranco/status/1253781746929356800.

5 In a previous research project, we produced a different kind of collection, in which we first searched for tweets matching the exact phrase “Marielle Franco” and then searched for 7 of the top 10 most frequent in that collection, resulting in a very large collection of more than 2,000,000 tweets sent between March 05 and 12 2021, including “Mariellepresente, #Quemmandoumatarmarielle” and others. The collection is publicly available here: https://catalog.docnow.io/datasets/20210812-marielle-franco-2021/.

---

DOI: 10.25189/bralin.v212.239  ISSN – on line: 0102-7158  V. XXI N. 2, 2022  revista.abralin.org
Table 1 illustrates the chronological distribution of tweets referencing Marielle Franco in Spanish, Portuguese, and English. Notably, the volume of posts surged significantly in both Spanish and English following her assassination, as well as during the first anniversary of her death, and in the subsequent years. In addition to these peaks, several other pivotal moments are worth highlighting. The spike in posts during October 2019 is linked to the testimony of a witness involved in Franco’s murder, who implicated former President Jair Bolsonaro. Similarly, in April 2020, amidst accusations by former Minister of Justice Sérgio Moro of interference in the investigation, Bolsonaro’s contentious speech drew widespread public outcry. This speech included a comparison between the investigation of Franco’s assassination and the inquiry into an attempted assassination on himself, which resonated intensely on Twitter. Additionally, the heightened volume of posts in October 2022 coincided with the Brazilian general elections, during which posts condemning Marielle Franco’s assassination galvanized digital communities and politicized digital publics. Table 1 also emphasizes the prevalence of posts in Portuguese compared to those in Spanish and English, demonstrating the global reach of digital discursive practices surrounding Marielle Franco. It underscores the notable intensity of technodiscursive practices within Brazil and Portuguese-speaking communities, as well as their strong reverberation in Spanish-speaking communities, especially across Latin America, and their impact on English-speaking digital communities.
Our subsequent task involved the development of a function to identify and measure the prevalence of 
hashtags for the purpose of pinpointing the most impactful hashtags steering the discourse on Marielle Franco. The utilization of hashtags on platforms like Twitter facilitates the dissemination of posts, fosters the creation of communities and counter-communities, enables participation in debates, delineates contentious spheres, and promotes the forging of alliances (Clark, 2015; Baronas, 2019). Hashtags serve as tools for argumentation, fostering digital engagement and establishing channels that connect communities of like-minded users (Clark, 2015; Baronas, 2019). Converging or opposing hashtags often coexist, serving to express emotions and interject in debates. They can encapsulate diverse struggles and at times connect opposed ideological demands (Baronas, 2019).

Table 2 presents the most frequently used hashtags in Portuguese tweets referencing Marielle Franco. Particularly noteworthy are hashtags like #MariellePresente and #MarielleVive, which serve to bring Marielle Franco's memory to the present, paying tribute to her legacy and condemning her assassination. These hashtags serve diverse purposes: disseminating information about commemorative events honouring her and supporting her legacy, expressing political solidarity, and criticizing opposing political figures, while also highlighting the lack of progress in resolving the case of her death. Posts often include the count of days and years since her passing, representing a form of datafication from below that resists the normalization of her death. This act of timekeeping serves as a form of resistance, drawing attention to her assassination and emphasizing the failure of the state to provide satisfactory answers.

The hashtag #FlorescerPorMarielle links to a website and cultural initiative launched by the PSOL political party, dedicated to commemorating her legacy through the sharing of tributes, artwork, and information about political movements centered around her memory. Other hashtags, like #JustiçaPorMarielleAnderson and #QuemMatouMarielle, are particularly focused on demanding justice in her case. These hashtags often receive support from various institutions and celebrities, including the
likes of the North American director Spike Lee (who is tagged with his own hashtag #SpikeLee), as well as universities, newspapers, and others.

Numerous related hashtags circulate alongside each other, forging a collective cadence in their demand for justice or in their efforts to keep Marielle Franco’s memory alive. Examples include “#MariellePresente #MarielleVive #MarielleVirouMultidão #MarielleFrancoPresente #QuemMatouMarielle #QuemMandouMatarMarielle,” often accompanied by images of protests, demonstrations, and photographs. Several news agencies are also frequently mentioned in hashtags, as they share updates on the ongoing investigations into her murder.

Furthermore, Marielle Franco’s name is also associated with hashtags reflecting politically opposing viewpoints, such as #GloboLixo, used to criticize the TV channel and newspaper Globo for allegedly pointing to Jair Bolsonaro’s potential involvement in her assassination. The hashtag #MarielleODocumentario references a documentary recounting her life and death, as well as other cultural works or activities in which she is commemorated or mentioned.

Table 3 displays the predominant hashtags in Spanish, which underscore the tributes to Franco’s memory, condemnations of her assassination, and highlighting her advocacy for the rights of black women and those from favelas, and shedding light on the social movements organized in Brazil and elsewhere in response to her murder. Other hashtags provide updates on the ongoing investigations into her death. Hashtags such as #MarielleVive and #MariellePresente underscore the need for mourning by invoking Franco’s name, striving to keep her spirit alive. Hashtags like #JusticiaPorMarielle, appearing in various forms, and #QuemMandouMatarMarielle, often linked with other hashtags such as #DerechosHumanos and #AmnistiaInternacional, denounce the involvement of powerful institutions in her assassination and the sluggishness of judicial authorities in investigating into her murder. Additionally, hashtags like #FeminicidioPolitico assert that her assassination was motivated by her identity as a black, gay, feminist woman actively engaged in exposing political and social injustices. Some hashtags explicitly mention former President Jair Bolsonaro, disseminating news about his
alleged involvement and of various acts of disapproval directed at him, his administration, and his policies. Others express support for current President Inácio Lula da Silva during the Brazilian elections of 2022. The data from this table underscores the high level of engagement among Spanish-speaking communities in the political and cultural discourse surrounding Marielle Franco, as well as their active participation in human rights advocacy for justice.

Table 4 illustrates the most prevalent hashtags in English tweets. It showcases the practice of accumulating and intertwining diverse hashtags, incorporating English alongside Portuguese ones, such as #humanrights, #Justice4Marielle, and #QuemMandouMatarMarielle. This amalgamation serves to bridge related movements and forms of activism between the North and the South, exemplified by the inclusion of hashtags like #SayHerName and #BlackLivesMatters. These hashtags connect the struggles and advocacy efforts of social movements in Brazil with those in the broader Americas, demanding justice and shedding light on issues of police brutality and the rights of Black Brazilians and LGBTQIA+ individuals within the global digital community. Originating from the African American Policy Forum (AAPF) and the Center for Intersectionality and Social Policy Studies (CISPS), the #SayHerName campaign sought to bring visibility, through acts of mourning, to the intersectional nature of oppression faced by female and transgender victims of police violence (Crenshaw et al., 2015). This campaign addressed the lack of attention often given to women victims compared to their male counterparts (Crenshaw et al., 2015). #BlackLivesMatter, on the other hand, was a hashtag created to give visibility to police violence against Black persons, which gained traction after 2014, after the assassination of Michael Brown in Ferguson, Missouri, and the emergence of street protests against police violence, which spurred its use in different social media platforms (Freelon; McIlwain; Clark, 2015).

Several other hashtags commemorate significant dates, including Marielle Franco’s birthday, the anniversary of her assassination, and other notable occasions. Hashtags like #Marielle41Anos and #3AnosSemRespostas are used to highlight the passage of time, serving as means to denounce and criticize the inaction of authorities. Similarly, hashtags like #DefendBlackWomenMarch and #WomensHistoryMonth emphasize the importance of memory and remembrance, linking specific days and months to the broader call for increased visibility of Black women in history. In this context,
memory plays a crucial role as invoking Marielle Franco’s name invites a questioning of the normalization of her death by publicly grieving her, evoking emotions such as disappointment, love, sadness, and helplessness, thereby reigniting the fervour for the causes she championed.

3. B) Forming political collectives through interpellation

The subsequent phase involved the development of a function that measured the use of "@" to identify the most frequently referenced accounts within the corpus of tweets. To safeguard users’ privacy, usernames were omitted if they did not belong to public institutions, public figures, or media outlets. The "@" function enables users to call attention to specific profiles, fosters citation, engagement, posting, and reposting of messages, thereby showcasing various social and cultural interactions on the platform. These interactions range from endorsements and critiques to direct address, highlighting the platform’s role in nurturing communities and counterpublics, and fostering increased user interaction.

Table 5 provides an overview of the most frequently referenced users in Portuguese. At the forefront is former president Jair Bolsonaro, with numerous tweets fervently calling for justice and transparency. Additionally, various Brazilian news outlets and human rights organizations are mentioned, which have played a significant role in disseminating information regarding her murder. Notably, Marielle Franco’s sister and Minister of Racial Equality, Anielle Franco, as well as the institute she established, Instituto Marielle Franco, feature prominently. Several key politicians, both at the state and federal levels, spanning the entire political spectrum, are among the most mentioned. These include President Lula da Silva, Marcelo Freixo, Franco’s former partner and state representative Mônica Benício, former Minister of Justice and federal representative Sérgio Moro, Secretary of Audiovisual Production of the Presidency of the Republic Ricardo Stuckert, Minister of Public Security and Defense Flavio Dino, and former governor of Rio de Janeiro Wilson Witzel.
The list also encompasses various social media influencers, celebrities, and actors. Notably, singer Katy Perry receives mentions due to her tribute to Marielle Franco during her concert in Rio de Janeiro, where she invited Franco's family onto the stage, thus drawing attention to the cause.

These mentions are indicative of the various mobilizations and initiatives aimed at seeking justice in Franco's case. Many posts express support for candidates and politicians who have actively championed the cause, while others criticize the apparent inaction of federal judicial authorities, passionately demanding accountability and justice for Marielle Franco. The data in the table underscores the inherently political nature of the digital discussions surrounding Marielle Franco, illustrating how digital communities strive to hold governments, states, and judicial systems accountable, demanding justice and drawing attention to her assassination. Thus, digital technodiscourses on Marielle Franco constitute counterpublics that, despite being dispersed across time and space, successfully politicize historical memory through collective action.

Table 6 displays the most referenced usernames in Spanish tweets concerning Marielle Franco. Notably, it includes some of the most prominent political figures in Brazil, such as former presidents, key representatives, and public officials. Among them are former president Jair Bolsonaro, current President Inácio Lula da Silva, and the socialist party PSOL, for which Franco served as a representative. Additional political figures featured in the table include former presidents Dilma Roussef and Michel Temer, former federal representative Jean Wyllys, the official account of the Brazilian Ministry of Justice, state representative and Franco's former partner Mônica Benício and Anielle Franco, the Minister of Racial Equality and Marielle Franco's sister. The table shows the highly political nature of this corpus, in which mourning and remembering Marielle Franco mobilizes political movements, spurs political endorsements, interpellations and critique and stimulate collective action among Spanish-speaking digital counterpublics.

Furthermore, the table encompasses a range of news agencies from Latin America, and Spain, comprising both mainstream and alternative media outlets, along with journalists and international human rights organizations. Spanish tweets in the corpus condemn and criticize former president Bolsonaro and Michel Temer, while expressing support for President Lula, former president Dilma.
Roussef, and other political figures who have actively participated in social movements advocating for justice in her case. Notably, several alternative media outlets in Latin America and Spain, featured in this corpus, have played a pivotal role in disseminating news and circulating information on the case.

Table 7 reveals the most frequently referenced usernames in English tweets. Notably, former President Jair Bolsonaro features prominently, alongside various other figures, including activists, journalists, and federal representatives who have actively disseminated information about Franco’s case within English-speaking communities. The list also encompasses a range of news media outlets, both mainstream and alternative, as well as artists, activists, professors, researchers, and academics associated with African American studies and Brazilian studies in the United States. Additionally, several antiracist media outlets and influencers are also highlighted.

Of particular significance is the mention of United States Congresswoman Alexandria Ocasio-Cortez, owing to her meeting with female and Black Brazilian political representatives, during which they paid tribute to Marielle Franco. This connection emphasizes the transnational reach of the discourse surrounding Franco’s legacy and the resonance of her story within global activist communities.

3. C) Topic Modelling: remembering Marielle Franco

To further explore the most salient themes in our corpus, we performed a technique for topic modelling on tweets in Portuguese, Spanish and English, which sought to map the most relevant topics in each corpus of tweets under analysis. For this purpose, we implemented several pre-processing techniques, which included: 1) tokenization of words according to terms that are important for our corpus; 2) stripping the corpus of links, usernames and other non-word characters; 3) elimination of a list of stopwords in Portuguese, English and Spanish; 4) implementation of a lemmatizing technique, after
which we grouped terms according to the most frequent with the same stem.\(^6\) The technique used was matrix factorization, particularly Nonnegative Matrix Factorization, and in this case Probabilistic Latent Semantic Analysis. We used a package created for Wolfram Mathematica, which allows for mapping from a collection of documents.\(^7\) We divided the text into documents (in our case, tweets), so that the algorithm can classify them into a series of topics, each of which is represented through a group of words. We decided to work with unigrams, and we considered the multiplicity of documents (tweets) and of words in each document (that is, how many times each word occurs in each tweet), and we ignored all punctuation and capitalization. We chose to generate 10 topics and among those, we selected the 5 more relevant and labelled each topic by manually selecting one (or two) words among the ones with highest score in each topic.\(^8\) With the selected topics and their labels, we generated graphs displaying the 20 words with higher scores in each topic. As the graphs in this section show, words do not belong exclusively to one topic, but different topics might share one or more words, which also defines the visual display of the graph, apart from which there is no other semantic difference between topics differently positioned in space.

It is important to note that we do not use topic modelling techniques to develop a pretended objective taxonomy of the data under analysis that would link the frequency of the presence or absence of items of meaning to social conditions of production and reception of discourses, neither we pretend that our data is raw or free from interference (Goldstone; Underwood, 2014; Josiowicz, Deusdará, 2022). We are aware of our role, as researchers, in the production of our corpus and in the creation of a cartography which enables us to explore (partially, given the limitation of the sample) the polyphonic, conflictive regions in which meaning emerges.

However, there are specificities to consider when using a large quantity of short documents (in our case, thousands, or millions of tweets). Because topic modelling techniques list the most common words in a particular topic by giving them a score, using a very large quantity of short documents and along a relatively large period of time (2018 to 2023) can end up occluding trends or patterns that might be meaningful for our research purposes. Because the topic modeling is a statistical simplification designed to make analyzing millions of documents possible, it can end up giving visibility to only certain trends and occluding others (Goldstone; Underwood, 2014). We decided to zoom in on the year 2020, precisely because of the potential of this period to give visibility to the polyphonic landscape of discursive practice from a plurality of voices, meanings and discursive formations around Marielle Franco.

We consider 2020 a key year for the digital discourses on Marielle Franco, when her name is used not only by her supporters but also by those of ex-president Bolsonaro, who created the hashtag #QuemmandoumatarBolsonaro in September 2018, right after his assassination attempt, and have

---


\(^7\) We used a package created for Wolfram Mathematica (ANTONOV, 2020), which allows for topic extraction from a collection of documents.

\(^8\) See Steinskog, Therkelsen and Gamback (2017); Wang, Liu and Yalou (2016) for sources on topic modelling techniques with tweets.
continued to use it until 2023.\(^9\) 2020 was also the year in which the police decided to close the investigation on the former president’s assassination attempt, which caused an explosion of the hashtag #QuemmandoumatarBolsonaro, with the highest use around May, when Bolsonaro gave a speech comparing Franco’s assassination to his murder attempt and in September, in the anniversary of his assassination attempt.\(^10\) #QuemmandoumatarBolsonaro helps delimiting a hashtag war between discursive communities. Zooming in on this period allows us to better cartography the dialogical dimension, the interdiscursivity and the polemical character of our discursive space. To grapple with the hierarchical nature of Twitter’s algorithmic infrastructure, with some voices and themes more visible than others, these and other delimitations allow us to search for tangential trends, to excavate the multidimensionality and to delimit conflictive subregions, zones of the polemical and the forbidden. We seek to indicate the relations that the discourses on Marielle instigate, not only affirming, but also establishing the others in relation to which they maintain a distance, and the digital battles that are created and established therein.

Figure 1 illustrates the topic modelling of Portuguese tweets related to Marielle Franco during the year 2020. The "Saber" topic underscores the need for a comprehensive inquiry to elucidate the circumstances surrounding Franco’s tragic murder. References to her death and the delayed resolution

---


of the case are underscored through words like "missing," "passed," "solution," "killed," "executed," and "clarified." Similarly, the "Assassinato" topic highlights terms like "democracy," "clarification," "victims," "politics," "executed," and "reasons," all of which emphasize the collective demand for justice. The "Respostas" topic, reminiscing on a tribute paid to Franco by celebrity Katy Perry during her visit to Brazil in 2018, includes a tweet featuring a video of Perry’s performance, which prominently displayed Franco’s image, emphasizing the need for answers and highlighting the passage of time. The "Valores" topic incorporates heavily shared tweets, notably one by Anielle Franco, the late activist’s sister, addressing former President Bolsonaro and criticizing his comparison of his own attempted assassination to Marielle's murder. The "Bolsonaro" topic delves into the discussion surrounding the mention of Bolsonaro by a witness, a claim that was subsequently refuted, and various hypotheses considered during the investigation, with some tweets noting the role of the Journal and TV channel Globo in the proceedings. The analysis of the topic modelling underscores the deeply political nature of the digital discourses on Marielle Franco, closely intertwined with the pursuit of remembrance and justice. As seen in the graphs' multiple connections (the words shared among topics), there is a relative homogeneity of the discourses on Marielle Franco. However, there are differences, as some seek to inform, while others demand answers and highlight the importance of memory and justice. The term "Memory", in fact, emerges as one of the most recurrent words in the dataset, appearing 45,068 times in Portuguese, spanning different forms and ways of memorializing. There are tweets that inform about acts and events that homage her and her memory at the national and international level; there are mentions of her legacy in Brazilian politics, particularly among Black women politicians and civil rights activists; there are also different types of attacks against her memory, name and role, which are in turn criticised. In Portuguese, topics point to the different moments of the criminal investigation of her murder, claiming for justice and answers and showing the intricate political connections of the case.

11 https://twitter.com/tracklist/status/1263674212276895745

12 https://twitter.com/aniellefranco/status/1253781746929356800
Figure 2 illustrates the topic modelling of Spanish tweets related to Marielle Franco during the year 2020. The “Cumplen” topic calls attention to the passage of time, and the lack of justice in her case, pointing to the anniversaries of her murder as important occasions for seeking memory, justice and denouncing impunity, and highlighting Franco’s role as a Human Rights activist. “Negra” topic also points to Franco’s political activism, as a Black woman and LGTQIA+ activist, as well as a favela-dweller, who denunciated military and police violence in Rio de Janeiro. “Mujeres” topic highlights her struggles for human rights and against inequalities, pointing to Franco’s centrality for feminist and antiracist youth social movements. “Concejala” is a topic that points not only to her role as congresswoman but also to the fact that her former partner Mônica Benício was also elected councilwoman in Rio de Janeiro, which was considered a continuation of her struggle. “Asesinato” topic shares news about the ongoing investigation concerning her murder and mentions accusations that were made towards former president’s Bolsonaro family members. It also announces the publication of a book with her writings on the favelas. There are multiple words connecting different topics. However, the words that are in the center, which appear in different topics, are related to the demands for justice, the importance...
of memory, and the relevance of Franco’s figure for feminist, antiracist and human rights activism among Spanish-speaking discursive communities in the world. The remembrance of her legacy and activism point to her as an important figure for feminist, antiracist, LGBTQIA+ social movements in Latin America and Europe. Social movements against feminicide, such as #NiUNAMenos also recuperate her memory. In addition, some posts share the news of the publication, in 2020, of a book with her writings, entitled Laboratorio Favela. Violencia y política en Rio de Janeiro (https://tintalimon.com.ar/libro/laboratorio-favela/), which reveals that her work is read and explored by academics as well as activists.

In Figure 3, the topic modelling of English tweets concerning Marielle Franco in 2020 is presented. The "Accountable" topic emphasizes the lack of answers in Franco’s assassination, featuring a tweet by Tom Philips, the Latin American correspondent for The Guardian, which reported the removal of a tweet by a governmental advisor mocking Franco’s death. This way, they denounce how Brazilian politicians and political aids were involved in disseminating hate against Franco and satirizing her

---

13 https://twitter.com/tomphillipsin/status/1225151532880015360
death. The "Black women" topic (labelled with two words to convey the intersectionality of Franco's activism) commemorates Franco's efforts in advocating for human rights and her significant contributions to Brazilian politics. The "Activist" topic highlights her advocacy for Black feminism as a bisexual politician, incorporating terms associated with remembrance, such as "forget." It highlights the relevance of her struggles for human rights, for LGBTQIA+ persons and for people living in the favelas. The "Killed" topic sheds light on the condemnation of Franco's murder and her outspoken criticism of extrajudicial killings. Furthermore, the "Police" topic underscores her activism against police brutality in the favelas and the pivotal role her campaign played in shedding light on violence associated with this cause. Words that connect different topics are related to feminist and LGBTQIA+ activism, specifically pointing to the memory of her murder and her denunciation of police brutality. There are strong connections with movements such as #BlackLivesMatter and #SayHerName. Among English-speaking communities, researchers, academics and cultural celebrities appear prominently, which are not as salient in Portuguese (perhaps occluded by the power and visibility of mainstream media). This shows the different cultural spheres – all highly educated – in which she was mobilized.

4. Conclusion: Digital Memorializing as a Radical Performance

In conclusion, our study illuminates the inherently political nature of the technodiscourses surrounding Marielle Franco. Technodiscourses politicize Franco's memory: they memorialize and mourn through hashtags, form political collectives, and denounce adversaries through interpellation (@). Posts go beyond simply informing, as they emphasize the need to denounce, demand justice and remember. Our analysis reveals distinct discursive communities, each with unique characteristics. Within Portuguese-speaking communities, Franco holds immense significance within Brazilian politics, occupying a central place in the sociopolitical vocabulary. She garners extensive coverage in mainstream and alternative media outlets, which inform about the details and stages of the criminal investigation. This prominence within Brazilian public and political discourse influences the algorithmic structure of the technodiscourses. Conversely, in English and Spanish-speaking communities, Franco's legacy resonates strongly with social movements, particularly those advocating for human rights, antiracism and LGBTQIA+ rights. Alternative news media and social movements play a pivotal role in amplifying Franco's influence beyond Brazil, emphasizing her importance for feminist, antiracist, LGBTQIA+ activist in Latin America and Europe, fortifying alliances among social movements. Notably, the dissemination of her writings in Spanish-speaking communities points to the intricate connection between digital activism and scholarly engagement. In English speaking communities, movements connect her figure with intersectional struggles and advocacy efforts against police brutality, with prominent figures from academia and culture engaging actively. These observations underscore the diverse
discursive communities that mobilize Franco’s memory, reflecting a highly politicized and datafied framework of remembrance.

Our analysis shows that the act of remembrance and celebration of Franco’s legacy is connected with a search for justice and a denunciation of human rights abuses, pointing to mourning as constitutive of digital discursive practices, as well as of a discursive community, a digital counterpublic around Franco on Twitter. The digital practice of remembering Marielle Franco encompasses a practice of datafication from below, as they repeatedly refer to the number of days, months and years passed, celebrating or honouring the anniversary of her passing and her birthday. Counting serves as a tool for remembering, for countering the naturalization of injustice. Naming, together with practices of datafication, implies making governments and justice systems accountable, denouncing abuses and stimulating collective action. The digital practice of naming Marielle Franco, denouncing her assassination as an act of memory and a demand for justice, implies the constitution of a discursive community, that is, of a counterpublic. As such, naming Marielle Franco constitutes a highly political act. Our paper shows that the practice of naming Marielle Franco has persisted, instead of extinguishing, between 2018 and 2023 as a way of reasserting collective identity. Naming Marielle Franco, as a practice of memory, serves towards different discursive purposes: it serves to sensibilize unaware publics on the violence inflicted to Black persons and antiracist activists as well as to persons living in the favelas; it highlights the vulnerability of LGBTQIA+ people; it mobilizes support for Black female representatives in different spheres of government; it creates and recreates a genealogy of antiracist and feminist thinkers. In all these ways, the practice of naming Marielle Franco, as way of mourning, creates a vocabulary to speak about the intersectional nature of oppression, it constitutes a genealogy of social-justice activists. Thus, naming Marielle Franco implies the constitution of a digital discursive performance of mourning and a digital counterpublic.

Additional information

Authors’ Evaluation and Response

Evaluation: https://doi.org/10.25189/rabralin.v23i2.2223.R

EDITORS

Roberlei Alves Bertucci
Affiliation: Federal University of Technology – Paraná
ORCID: https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4014-5610
This paper investigates tweets that include "Marielle Franco" in three ways: looking at the tags, at the users mentioned, and performing topic modelling.

They use tweets in three languages (Portuguese, Spanish and English), but I cannot understand why they present the results in Spanish first for the A) and B) analyses, since the Portuguese ones would be the most frequent, and the most interesting. So I absolutely suggest that they change the order of presentation.

As to topic modelling, I do not understand why they used only the year 2020 and not the totality of the tweets they harvested.

Also on the topic modelling analysis, I believe one needs more details to be able to understand how it was done: how many topics were requested, who named the topics, and what exactly do the visualizations show? Does the relative place in the diagrams have any meaning?

On the other hand, it is very interesting to see that the main topics are so different in the three languages/collections: The fact that Marielle was a woman, and was black, two prominent topics in Spanish, are absent in Portuguese. In English, there is a topic "black women" (which is weird given that all other topics have just one word as name), and topics "activist" and "police", which are missing from the other languages. These topics obviously resonnate with US politics.
In Brazilian politics there is apparently more concrete attention to the extreme right who have assassinated her and who, in the government, prevent prosecution and clarification, and users seem to be more interested and aroused by concrete events and facts.

I think that these contrastive differences could benefit from more discussion in the paper.

Finally, I have a question about collecting tweets always including the phrase "Marielle Franco". While I think this is right for Spanish and English, I would deem it too restrictive for Portuguese, where the phrase "Marielle, presente" was one of the most important slogans. Many tweets would exist that only mentioned "Marielle" (especially after her assassination) or "Marielle, presente!". It would be interesting to study/check the precision and recall of "Marielle" alone. If not possible for this paper, at least it should be mentioned.

Conflict of interest

The authors have no conflicts of interest to declare.

Data Availability Statement

We have checked Equator network guidelines and there are no guidelines to report. The code used was published here: https://github.com/AlejandraJosiowicz/Marielle_Franco_Memory and here: https://www.wolframcloud.com/obj/alejandrajosiowicz/Marielle_Franco_Research

The data utilized in this work is available here: https://github.com/AlejandraJosiowicz/ObservatorioMulheresLatinoamericanas/tree/main/ColetaMarielleFranco. Collection of IDS of tweets that include the phrase "Marielle Franco" in Spanish, Portuguese, and English between March 14, 2018, the day of her assassination, and March 19, 2023, 5 days after the 5th anniversary of her death. The extraction was performed using the Twitter Academic Search, launched in 2021, which allowed for the collection of historical tweets since 2006 and until May 2023, in multiple languages. We collected tweets...
The code used is available here: https://github.com/AlejandraJosiovicz/Marielle_Franco_Memory and here: https://www.wolframcloud.com/obj/alejandrajosiowicz/Marielle_Franco_Research

Financial source

This study was financed by the Fundação Carlos Chagas Filho de Amparo à Pesquisa do Estado do Rio de Janeiro

REFERÊNCIAS


